

West Area Planning Committee:

10th November 2015

Application Number: 15/02603/FUL

Decision Due by: 28th October 2015

Proposal: Erection of a two storey side extension to create 2 x 1-bed flats (Use Class C3) with provision of private amenity space, bin and cycle store and alterations to existing vehicle access. Erection of a two storey rear extension and replacement and alterations to porch to existing dwelling.

Site Address: 105 Godstow Road, **Appendix 1.**

Ward: Wolvercote Ward

Agent: Mr David Williams

Applicant: Mr Ken Howard

The application was called into committee by Councillors Goddard, Fooks, Royce and Wilkinson for the following reasons: overdevelopment, car parking, impact on neighbours and design.

Recommendation:

APPLICATION BE APPROVED

The West Area Planning Committee is recommended to grant planning permission for the following reasons:

Reasons for Approval

For the following reasons:

- 1 The proposed demolition of the existing extension and erection of a new extension to provide increased accommodation for the existing dwelling house at 105 Godstow Road plus two one bedroom flats would be acceptable in terms of its design and impact on the streetscene. The proposed development would not have a detrimental impact on the amenity of neighbouring residential occupiers, having had specific regard to the impact of the development on privacy and light. The proposed arrangements for parking and access are acceptable and would not have an adverse impact on highway safety. The proposed accommodation to be provided in the flats would be acceptable in terms of the quality of living accommodation and availability of outdoor space. The proposed development would not have a detrimental impact on the character, appearance and special significance of the Conservation Area. In reaching a decision to approve the application there has been a thorough consideration of all the relevant matters including the objections and comments

raised in relation to proposals. It is concluded that the development is acceptable in the context of the Council's adopted planning policies and specifically Policy CP1, CP6, CP8, CP10 and HE7 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016, Policy CS11, CS12 and CS18 of the Core Strategy (2011) and Policy HP9, HP10, HP14, HP15 and HP16 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013).

- 2 The Council considers that the proposal accords with the policies of the development plan as summarised below. It has taken into consideration all other material matters, including matters raised in response to consultation and publicity. Any material harm that the development would otherwise give rise to can be offset by the conditions imposed.

Conditions

- 1 Development begun within time limit
- 2 Develop in accordance with approved plans
- 3 Materials
- 4 Demolition of Extension
- 5 Boundary Treatments
- 6 Parking areas
- 7 Cycle parking
- 8 Surface water drainage and SUDs
- 9 Landscaping

Principal Planning Policies

Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016

CP1 - Development Proposals

CP6 - Efficient Use of Land & Density

CP8 - Design Development to Relate to its Context

CP10 - Siting Development to Meet Functional Needs

HE7 - Conservation Areas

Core Strategy

CS2_ - Previously developed and greenfield land

CS10_ - Waste and recycling

CS11_ - Flooding

CS12_ - Biodiversity

CS18_ - Urban design, town character, historic environment

CS23_ - Mix of housing

Sites and Housing Plan

HP2_ - Accessible and Adaptable Homes

HP9_ - Design, Character and Context

HP10_ - Developing on residential gardens

HP12_ - Indoor Space

HP13_ - Outdoor Space

HP14_ - Privacy and Daylight

HP15_ - Residential cycle parking

HP16_ - Residential car parking

Other Material Considerations:

National Planning Policy Framework

This application lies within the Wolvercote with Godstow Conservation Area.

Planning Practice Guidance

Balance of dwellings Supplementary Planning Document (SPD)

Relevant Site History:

None

Third Party Representations Received:

39 Meadow Prospect, 111 Godstow Road, 108 Godstow Road, 34 Meadow Prospect, 13 Meadow Prospect, 6 Meadow Prospect, 8 Meadow Prospect, 1 Meadow Prospect, 1 Home Close, 9 Meadow Prospect, 36 Meadow Prospect, 35 Meadow Prospect, 11 Meadow Prospect, 39 Meadow Prospect, 103 Godstow Road, 3 Meadow Prospect, 102 Godstow Road, 27 Meadow Prospect, objections:

- Access
- Amount of development on site
- Effect on adjoining properties
- Effect on character of area
- Effect on traffic
- Flooding risk
- Impact on light
- Parking provision
- Impact on highway safety
- Poor design
- Lack of landscaping
- Development would project beyond building line
- Impact on green space
- Impact on conservation area
- Information missing from plans
- Height of proposal
- Development would reduce the openness in village and streetscene
- Effect on community facilities
- Public transport provision/accessibility
- Poor choice of materials (timber cladding)

Statutory and Other Consultees:

Oxford Civic Society, objections:

- The development would have an adverse impact on the Conservation Area, in particular the character of the Conservation Area.
- Concerns that the development would fail to preserve or enhance the Conservation Area.
- Proposed scheme is a poor design, particularly the use of timber cladding.

Highway Authority: No objections, subject to conditions relating to the provision of car parking, cycle and bin storage, the use of porous materials for paving and the provision of vision splays.

Issues:

- Principle of Development
- Design
- Conservation Area
- Impact on residents
- Access
- Parking
- Flooding and Drainage
- Biodiversity
- Noise and Lighting

Site Description

1. 105 Godstow Road is a three bedroom 1930s semi-detached house occupying a corner plot on the junctions of Godstow Road and Meadow Prospect in the village of Wolvercote.
2. The application site encompasses the entire residential curtilage of 105 Godstow Road which benefits from a rear garden of approximately 11m in length as well as substantial side and front gardens. Access is provided from the highway (Meadow Prospect) into the front garden which is used for parking. There is also an existing garage at the rear and a separate road access provided to that garage from Meadow Prospect.
3. 105 Godstow Road has previously been extended with the additions of a lean-to side extension and flat roof rear extension.
4. The application site is enclosed by a low boundary wall on the Godstow Road and Meadow Prospect elevations; a 1.8m high close boarded timber fence separates the property from No. 1 Meadow Prospect and No. 103 Meadow Prospect.
5. The adjoining property, 103 Godstow Road (that forms the other half of the pair of semi-detached properties) has been extended with a substantial two-storey side extension and a single storey rear extension.
6. In front of the application site is a substantial area of verge that separates the front garden of 105 Godstow Road from the highway. This land contains a telephone pole and BT cabinets. As a result of this the front elevation of 105 Godstow Road is in fact set back approximately 15m from the footway and highway of Godstow Road.
7. The character of the area is that of an established residential area with predominately large family homes, mostly benefiting from front gardens. To the west of the application site lies the centre of Wolvercote village with a greater variety of property types that reflect the development of the village over a long period of time. Mature vegetation and wide verges contribute positively to the character and appearance of the application site's locality and add to the semi-rural qualities of the area.

8. The entire application site lies within the Wolvercote and Godstow Conversation Area.

Proposals

9. It is proposed to demolish the existing single storey rear and side extensions to 105 Godstow Road and erect a two storey side and rear extension. The two storey side extension is proposed to contain two self-contained one bedroom flats. The two storey rear extension is proposed to contain additional accommodation for the retained family dwellinghouse at 105 Godstow Road.
10. The proposed development would involve the creation of a 6m wide side extension that would project beyond the original rear wall of 105 Godstow Road by 3.7m. The proposed rear extension would extend across approximately one third of the rear wall of the dwellinghouse; accommodated along the part of the rear wall that is furthest from the adjoining neighbour at No. 103 Godstow Road. The rear extension would project into the garden by 3.2m from the original rear wall of the house.
11. The height to the eaves of the development is proposed to match the existing dwellinghouse, with a maximum height to the ridge of 7m (which is approximately half a metre lower than the existing dwellinghouse). The proposed extensions would be set slightly further back than the front of the original house.
12. In addition to the rear and side extensions it is also proposed to erect a small porch on the front of 105 Godstow Road. It is considered that regardless of the submitted application it is likely that this development would be considered permitted development not requiring planning permission.
13. The proposed development is specified to be constructed with an external finish of render on the front, rear and side elevations with a limited amount of timber cladding on the side elevation. The proposed roof would be constructed with plain clay tiles to match the existing dwelling.
14. A portion of the rear garden would provide space for the parking of two cars by the occupiers of 105 Godstow Road on the site of the existing garage and making use of the existing access in this location (onto Meadow Prospect). The proposed development would therefore give rise to a retained garden area for the existing dwellinghouse at 105 Godstow Road of between 11m and 5m. 105 Godstow Road is proposed to retain a front garden with a path to the front door.
15. The proposed flats would benefit from a shared rear garden amenity space of approximately 5m. The entrances to these properties would be on the side of the proposed development (facing onto Meadow Prospect). Parking for two cars (one for each of the flats) would be provided in the front garden in the existing car parking area; the existing access is

proposed to be widened to provide an enlarged opening onto Meadow Prospect.

16. All of the proposed parking areas are shown on the submitted plans to be constructed from permeable block paving.
17. The majority of boundary treatments are proposed to be retained on the site apart from the removal of some of the low stone boundary wall to provide the space for the enlarged access into the front parking area. It is proposed to erect a 1.8m high close boarded timber fence to enclose the shared rear garden amenity space for the proposed flats.
18. The proposed development would incorporate some landscaping; this would involve planting around the ground floor windows to provide privacy for the proposed flat.

Assessment

Principle of Development

19. Policy CP2 of the Core Strategy requires that the majority of development should take place on previously developed sites where appropriate. The proposed development would take place on land that is currently occupied in part by existing extensions but would mostly be situated on land that is residential garden land. Residential garden land is not defined as previously developed land as set out in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF). However, in the scope of the Council's adopted planning policies, specifically Policy CP6 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016 and Policies HP9 and HP10 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013) there is scope to accept the principle of development on garden land where there is sufficient residual garden land provided and subject to all other constraints. In this case, Officers consider that 105 Godstow Road has a significant area of garden land that provides ample outdoor amenity space and that there is scope to consider that more efficient use of this land could be made. The resulting development would not create a harmful deficit in amenity space on the site and Officers therefore consider the development is acceptable.

Balance of Dwellings

20. Policy CS23 of the Oxford Core Strategy requires that new developments provide a mix of sizes of dwellings to maintain the provision of different types of homes within the City. The proposed development falls below the threshold of four dwellings where a specified mixture of sizes of dwellings from new developments is required. Despite this; Officers have been mindful of the requirement of the policy that seeks to ensure that family dwellings are not lost. In this case, Officers consider that the development of the proposed extension to the existing house would enable the retention of a family home on the site and thereby meet the requirements of Policy CS23 and the Balance of Dwellings Supplementary Planning Document

(SPD).

Community Infrastructure Levy

21. The proposed development requires the payment of a CIL contribution.

Design and Impact on Conservation Area

Visual Appearance and Siting

22. Officers consider that the design of the proposed development would be acceptable in terms of its impact on the streetscene. Having had regard to the already substantial extensions to the adjoining property (103 Godstow Road) it is considered that the proposed development would effectively form a mirror reflection of that development and would not appear unbalanced when viewed from Godstow Road. Despite the overall bulk and scale of development proposed the fact that the property is set back from Godstow Road would mean it would not be overbearing or obtrusive in the streetscene. Officers consider that the use of the 'set back' of the front elevation and the reduced overall height to the ridge would ensure that the development would be visually subservient to original dwellinghouse on the site and thereby ensure that the proposals would not create a monolithic or overly prominent built form.

23. Officers have had regard to the impact on the appearance of Meadow Prospect and the views of the development from that elevation. It is noted that the proposed development would protrude beyond the building line of properties in Meadow Prospect by approximately 5m. Despite this, Officers have been mindful of the context of the site and the impact on the streetscene of Meadow Prospect that would result from the proposed development being further forward than neighbouring properties. Meadow Prospect itself does have a strong rhythm of development, with pairs of 1930s houses being a uniform distance from the highway. Despite this, No. 107 Godstow Road which is situated on the opposite side of the road from No. 105 Godstow Road also projects beyond the building line by approximately 5m. Officers do not regard this to set a precedent in terms of allowing the development of a corner plot on the application site but it does serve as a useful comparison in terms of considering the visual impact of the proposed development. 107 Godstow Road does not appear to be visually incongruous or awkward in the context of the streetscene of Meadow Prospect; the use of matching materials and a similar architectural style enables it to harmonise effectively with the rest of the streetscene. Officers consider that for similar reasons the proposed development at 105 Godstow Road could be accommodated on the site despite its siting beyond the building line of Meadow Prospect.

24. Following on from the above, Officers have noted that despite the fairly uniform appearance of Meadow Prospect, the wider context of the site does not have a uniform pattern of development; the varying siting and appearance of buildings reflects the historic development of the village.

25. There are features of the proposed development that contribute positively to its overall proposed appearance. Officers consider that the use of similar materials, roof pitch, the bay window and carefully considered fenestration mean that the development would be acceptable visually.

Materials

26. Officers have carefully considered the proposed materials for the development. The majority of materials proposed to be used would match the existing dwelling on the site and would be sympathetic to neighbouring properties in both Godstow Road and Meadow Prospect. Despite this, there are proposals to include some timber cladding on the side elevation of the proposed development as well as the porch. Officers have recommended that a condition be included to specifically omit this detail as it be a visually jarring feature that would be at odds with the character and appearance of the area; the areas shown to be clad in timber would instead be specified to have render to match the existing house.

27. The proposed porch would be a fairly small scale feature that would not detract from the appearance of the property as a whole. As previously stated, Officers also consider that the development is permitted development and would not therefore require planning permission.

Conservation Area

28. The proposed development lies within the Wolvercote and Godstow Conservation Area. Officers have had regard to the Conservation Area appraisal and carefully considered the proposals in terms of the character appearance and special significance of the area. The proposed use of materials (subject to the points raised above and the suggested condition) would be suitable in the Conservation Area. Also, the retention of open space around parts of the site mean that the rural appearance of the area as well as views into and out of the village centre would not be materially harmed by the development.

Living Conditions

29. The proposed flats would all have a good quantity of indoor space; each having an internal floor area of 50m² which would meet the Council's planning policy for indoor space provision (HP12 of the Sites and Housing Plan). Further to this, Officers have assessed the quality of indoor environment that is proposed and this would meet the other requirements of the Council's policies for indoor space quality. There are windows on the side elevation as well as the front and rear elevations which would provide natural light within the flats as well as ventilation.

30. Officers have had regard to Policy HP2 of the Sites and Housing Plan that seeks to ensure that new developments meet the requirements of being accessible and adaptable homes; making use of some of the criteria set out in

Lifetime Homes Standards. All of the flats have a simple internal layout that would give them the opportunity to provide adaptable accommodation. Officers have had regard to the circulation within the lobby and flats that is proposed in the submitted floor plans and consider this is acceptable in the context of Policy HP2 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013).

31. In terms of outdoor space provision the flats would have a small shared garden to the rear of the plot that would provide an acceptable area of outdoor amenity space. Officers therefore consider that the outdoor space provision is acceptable in the context of the Council's policies, specifically Policy HP13 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013).
32. Officers have included a condition as part of the recommendation that would require the provision of the proposed boundary treatments prior to the first occupation of the development to ensure the privacy of occupiers.

Refuse and Recycling Store

33. Refuse bins are proposed to be located adjacent to the entrance to the flats. The proposals do not involve a screened store but because of the close proximity of the bin store area to the retained boundary wall there would be ample screening whilst also providing a practical location for storing bins. Officers therefore consider that the proposed layout for refuse and recycling bins is acceptable.

Impact on Residents

34. Officers have carefully considered the comments and objections raised in relation to the proposed development.
35. The proposed development would not have an adverse impact on light for neighbouring residential occupiers. The proposed development would be sited furthest from the adjoining neighbour at No. 103 Godstow Road so would not therefore impinge upon the light into the rear windows of that property. The proposed development would also not detrimentally alter light conditions for No. 1 Meadow Prospect (having had regard specifically to the overall height of the development that would also project into the rear garden of the application site). In making this assessment Officers have considered the proposals in the context of the 25/45 degree code as set out in Policy HP14 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013).
36. Officers consider that the proposed development would not have a detrimental impact on privacy for neighbouring residential occupiers. The proposed side windows facing towards No. 107 Godstow Road would not provide overlooking into the garden of that property as a result of the separation distance provided between the properties (approximately 11m to the boundary). To the rear of the application site lies No. 1 Meadow Prospect; the windows on the rear elevation of the proposed development would be approximately 7.5m from the boundary with No. 1 Meadow Prospect which would protect the privacy of occupiers of that property. No

side windows are proposed that would face into the garden of No. 103 Godstow Road.

37. Concerns have been raised by local residents relating to the visual impact of the proposed development. Officers consider that the design of the development and its impact on the Conservation Area are acceptable for the reasons previously outlined.

Access and Parking

38. The proposed access arrangements for the development would be acceptable and the Highway Authority have not raised any objections. The proposals involve the use of existing accesses at the front and rear of No. 105 Godstow Road; with modest increases in the width of the access at the front of the property. Officers have included a condition in the recommendation that would ensure that the proposed access enhancements and parking area were provided prior to the first occupation of the development.

39. Officers consider that the proposed parking provision on the site would be acceptable. Two spaces would be provided for the existing dwellinghouse at 105 Godstow Road and one space each would be provided for the new flats; this would meet the Council's requirements in terms of Policy HP16 of the Sites and Housing Plan.

40. Officers have had regard to the provision of cycle parking for the proposed development. Officers have included a condition in the recommendation that requires the cycle parking to be provided prior to occupation.

Flooding and Drainage

41. The application site lies within the defined area of low flood risk where there would be a risk of flooding of between 1 in 1000 and 1 in 100. However, the site lies within in an area where there is an increased risk of surface water flooding. As a result, Officers have included in the recommendation that a condition should be included that requires details of surface water drainage management to be submitted to and approved in writing by the Council prior to the commencement of work.

Biodiversity

42. The application site is not considered to be a site that would likely be a habitat for protected species.

Conclusion:

43. The proposal is considered to accord with the relevant policies of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026, Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016, and Sites and Housing Plan 2011-2016. Therefore officer's recommendation to the Members of the West Area Planning Committee is to approve the development subject to the

conditions as set out above.

Human Rights Act 1998

Officers have considered the Human Rights Act 1998 in reaching a recommendation to grant planning permission, subject to conditions. Officers have considered the potential interference with the rights of the owners/occupiers of surrounding properties under Article 8 and/or Article 1 of the First Protocol of the Act and consider that it is proportionate.

Officers have also considered the interference with the human rights of the applicant under Article 8 and/or Article 1 of the First Protocol caused by imposing conditions. Officers consider that the conditions are necessary to protect the rights and freedoms of others and to control the use of property in accordance with the general interest. The interference is therefore justifiable and proportionate.

Section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998

Officers have considered, with due regard, the likely effect of the proposal on the need to reduce crime and disorder as part of the determination of this application, in accordance with section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998. In reaching a recommendation to grant planning permission, officers consider that the proposal will not undermine crime prevention or the promotion of community safety.

Background Papers:

15/02603/FUL

Contact Officer: Robert Fowler

Extension: 2104

Date: 28th October 2015

This page is intentionally left blank